A new approach to the authentication of goldwork
Using combined Scanning Electron Microscopy and External-beam PIXE
Une nouvelle approche pour l’authentification des objets en or en couplant la
microscopie électronique à balayage et le PIXE en faisceau extrait

Olivier Bobin and Hervé Guegan
A new approach to the authentication of goldwork using combined Scanning Electron Microscopy and External-beam PIXE

Une nouvelle approche pour l’authentification des objets en or en couplant la microscopie électronique à balayage et le PIXE en faisceau extrait

Olivier Bobin* and Hervé Guegan**

Abstract: The study of goldwork encompasses several large fields of investigations. Scientific analyses can respond to questions concerning production techniques, provenance and preservation. However, what about authentication? This type of works of art generally has very high prices, leading to an increase in the number of forgeries. Today, fakes can imitate artworks produced by most civilisations and with different origins. Moreover, most of the objects we analyse cannot be submitted to destructive sampling. That is the reason why we employ external-beam PIXE for the analysis of such objects, a method able to offer reliable and non-intrusive scientific investigations. Our methodology consists of two steps, which, in their combination, provide information about the chronological compatibility of the objects with their presumed period. First, an optical and electronic microscope investigation allows us to identify tool marks, weathering features, to reveal traditional or fraudulent surface treatments, and to characterise superficial deposits. This first approach is able to identify bad quality fakes. However, these analyses are generally insufficient to establish the authentication of the objects. That is why we also perform external-beam PIXE analyses on goldwork. Thus, the qualitative and quantitative studies of trace elements are able to provide insights into metallurgical methods and the fineness of alloys. This paper describes our methodology and presents different examples of its application, including the discussion of specific problems encountered in the analysis of this type of objects.

Résumé : Les objets en or sont étudiés par des approches très diverses, et parmi celles-ci les analyses scientifiques répondent généralement à des problématiques concernant la recherche des techniques de fabrication ou l’étude de provenance et de conservation. Mais, qu’en est-il de l’authentification ? Ce type d’objets d’art étant en effet d’une valeur marchande élevée, ils sont de plus en plus souvent sujets à des contrefaçons, qui imitent aujourd’hui la plupart des styles et des civilisations. Les investigations scientifiques doivent être absolument non destructive et la technique PIXE en faisceau extrait est alors idéale pour ce type d’expertise. Nous avons ainsi développé une méthodologie qui nous fournira un faisceau d’indices qui sera compatible ou pas avec l’ancienneté présumée de l’objet. En premier lieu, l’examen par microscopie optique et électronique permet d’identifier les traces d’outils, les figures de corrosion, de révéler si l’objet a subi des traitements de surface anciens ou modernes et de caractériser la nature des dépôts superficiels. Ce premier niveau d’investigation permet d’écarter les faux flagrants ou de mauvaise qualité. Toutefois, cette étude est généralement insuffisante pour établir l’ancienneté d’un objet en or. C’est pourquoi, nous réalisons en complément une étude par PIXE en faisceau extrait qui détermine la composition en éléments traces, eux-mêmes révélateurs des méthodes métallurgiques et de la pureté des alliages. Ce texte décrit cette méthodologie et présente différents exemples d’application en précisant les problèmes auxquels nous avons été confrontés sur les différents types d’objets rencontrés.

Keywords: gold, analysis, Scanning Electron Microscope, Particle Induced X-ray Emission, external beam, trace elements, authentication, fakes.

Mots-clés : or, analyse, Microscope Électronique à Balayage, PIXE faisceau extrait, éléments traces, authentification, faux.

* CIRAM, Chem’Innov, 16 avenue Pey Berland 33607 Pessac cedex, France. (olivier.bobin@ciram-art.com)
** ARCANE – CENBG (UMR 5797, CNRS – IN2P3 / Université Bordeaux 1) – rue du Solarium BP120, 33 175 Gradignan, France. (arcane@cenbg.in2p3.fr)
1. Introduction

The analysis of goldwork interests archaeologists, art historians, or museum curators. The aims of such investigations are to study the style, the iconography, and the techniques of manufacture, to establish a hypothetical period and provenance of these objects, and to develop a strategy of conservation. To these purposes, scientists can contribute useful information regarding the composition of the alloy, the analysis of deposits, and the weathering degree. Most of the studies on gold artefacts aim to define the origins, trade and provenance of the ores based on the trace elements composition (Guerra and Calligaro, 2003; 2004; Bugoi et al., 2003; Demortier et al., 1999; Ontalba Salamanca et al., 1998).

Generally, few methodological studies exist about the authentication of gold (Craddock, 2009; Guerra, 2008). First of all, gold objects are very resistant to long time corrosion. Thus, we cannot establish our conclusions on the weathering degree of the gold alloy or the nature of the corrosion products, as for copper alloys (Craddock, 2009; Robbiola and Portier, 2006). Thermoluminescence tests, performed on casting cores, can provide interesting chronological information for bronze objects, for example (Craddock, 2009). However, goldwork does not typically contain residual cast cores. In addition, gold forgeries have become progressively flawless, as the falsifiers became aware of the scientific tools used in the authentication of works of art. It is quite easy to use ancient gold shreds to re-create a new and fake artefact, following an ancient style, and with a typical ancient trace elements composition. In this case, a single scientific approach, which only uses trace elements to distinguish fakes from original ancient goldwork, is no longer sufficient to discriminate all the forgeries. In order to improve the authentication of gold objects, this paper presents a combined approach, including as the first step an investigation of the surface by scanning electron microscopy (SEM-EDX) to observe tool marks, superficial deposits, the microstructure of the alloy, and eventual weathering features. As the second step, a quantitative analysis of the alloy by external-beam PIXE is employed, in order to define its trace element composition.

2. Methods

The study of the surface and the chemical composition of the deposits were carried out with an energy-dispersive X-ray spectrometer (EDS), using a 20 keV electron beam, coupled with a scanning electron microscope (SEM) Jeol JSM 840. These analyses were performed on the surface without pre-treatment or metallization. We employed both back-scattered electron (BSE) and secondary electron (SE) images.

External beam PIXE (Particle Induced X-Ray Emission) is a non-destructive method of analysis which allows determining the concentration of major, minor and trace elements. For this purpose, we used a 3MeV H⁺ ion beam produced by the singleton accelerator of CENBG (Centre d’Etudes Nucléaires de Bordeaux Gradignan). Due to the limits of the accelerator, this energy optimizes the ionisation cross-section for interesting elements, such as Sn, Sb, Cd, Ru, and Rh. In front of the dedicated external beam-line, artefacts can be analysed without sampling or limitations in terms of size. Two detectors are used in the experimental setup, and allow the measurement of emitted X-rays under the interaction with the incident ion beam, which constitute a spot size of 1 mm in diameter on the sample.

3. Results

SEM-EDS investigations

The micrographs of the surface provide information on the manufacturing techniques employed. We also searched for tools marks, such as those as a result of hammering, burnishing or polishing. Finally, we also investigated the decoration methods and analysed the superficial deposits. The small objects (less than 5 cm) can be placed in the specimen chamber of the SEM. This allowed us to directly determine their composition (major and minor elements) and observe their microstructure. For the bigger objects, we worked on surface replications (cellulose acetate film), which reveal the fingerprint of the surface and remove superficial deposits (Funga and Sanipelli, 1982).

This first step allows identifying the noticeable fakes, which show fundamental anomalies, such as modern tool marks or traces of acid attack.

Figure 1 shows a surface replication of a gold statuette presumed to originate from the New Kingdom of Egypt (1580-1085 BC). On the surface, we can observe very thin and unidirectional ridges, which cannot correspond to restoration or cleaning phases. They correspond to burnishing tool marks. This polishing technique was traditionally performed with a burnisher, a type of little hammer with a perfectly polished head (Ogden, 1993; Arminjon and Bilimoff, 1998; Scott, 1991). Nowadays, the burnishing is carried out with a mechanical burnisher using thousands of rotating micro-balls. The thinness and the regularity of the marks observed on the surface of this object are clearly a result of this modern technique.
Following the SEM-EDS study, we also detected silver chloride micro-particles, which are not mixed with the mineral deposits. In addition, we did not detect any silver sulphide micro-particles, which are usually also found in naturally corroded gold-silver alloys (Gusmano et al., 2004). As a consequence, it can be inferred that the silver chloride micro-particles originate from a deliberate chemical attack, carried out in order to simulate the natural weathering of the material. *Aqua regia* treatment leads to a partial dissolving of the metal and to the formation of numerous silver chloride micro-particles. Finally, we observed superficial cupules, which are also characteristic of an acid attack. This result is consistent with the large quantity of chlorine contained in the deposits. The presence, on the entire object, of modern tool marks and characteristics of chemical attack is inconsistent with the presumed period of this piece. It is thus easily understandable that, in this case, a complementary PIXE analysis is not necessary.

The second example concerns a gold earring from China, presumed to be from the Shang Dynasty (11th-10th centuries BC). The SEM observation of the superficial deposits shows an amorphous to non-crystalline material, which is composed of iron, chloride, calcium and silicated phases. The association of iron and chloride, and the microstructure of these deposits indicate that they correspond to residues of an acidic solution, such as ferric chloride (Perego, 2005). The contents of iron and chloride are too high to correspond to natural clay or ‘earth’. This indicates that the object underwent a surface treatment to modify the surface aspect of the object and to simulate mineral deposits and/or presence of copper corrosion products.

We can see that SEM surface analyses represent a powerful tool for discriminating the obvious fakes, which show formal traces of modernity. These investigations are necessary, but not sufficient, to establish an object’s authenticity, because it is easier to attest that an object is a forgery than to establish its authenticity (Robbiola and Portier, 2006).

**External-beam PIXE**

The external-beam PIXE developed at CENBG is one of the five beam-lines of the AIFIRA platform. Four of them are dedicated to macro-, micro-, and nano-analysis by nuclear techniques. AIFIRA is a brand new facility built in 2006 using the 40 years old experience of the CENBG in Ion Beam Analysis.

While some other external-beam PIXE facilities exist in the world, for the present study we have developed an experimental setup dedicated to the analysis of gold items. For this purpose, two types of information are interesting: the composition of the gold alloy and the trace elements. However, it is not possible to obtain both at the same time, with the same detector.

In our experimental setup, we simultaneously used two Si(Li) detectors with different shields in order to optimize the different types of investigated information. We will describe below the obtained spectra and the errors in interpretation which could occur if we did not pay attention.

The quantitative data corresponding to Figures 2 and 3 are not included in Table 1. The first spectrum reported is obtained from a gold necklace presumed to date from 1500 BC, with the detector equipped with a 315 µm carbon filter before the silicon crystal (Fig. 2). This setup was used to stop the backscattered proton beam and the low energy X-rays (especially M-lines from Au and L-lines from Ag, Sn, Cd, etc.). This spectrum allowed the determination of the Au/Ag/Cu composition (98.1/0.7/0.9%), and the detection of trace elements Fe (620 ppm) and Ni (114 ppm), because of their large X-ray emission cross-section. In addition, we had to move the detector away from the target to prevent pile-up effects, due to the fact that the counting rate was so high as compared to the frequency of the multi-channel analyser. Nevertheless, we observed on the spectrum four...
little sum peaks due to this phenomenon, which prevent the
detection of important elements in the process of authenti-
cation, like Pd and Cd. Furthermore, the little solid angle
in this configuration is not suitable for the detection of
other trace elements, like Sn and Sb, due to their low X-ray
emission cross-section, and the only interesting trace ele-
ment which could be detected is Pb, due to its L\textsubscript{γ} line at
14.762 KeV with a limit of detection (LOD) of 300 ppm.
Detection of other trace elements, such as Hg or Pt, is not
possible due to the high level of Au L-rays. At this stage of
the study, we were only able to determine the composition
of the alloy. Even if this information is important, it is not
sufficient for providing reliable chronological information
about the object.

The second experimental setup was thus necessary in order
to obtain data on other trace elements. In this configuration,
an absorbing copper foil (75 µm thick) is placed in front of
the detector. The reason we used copper is because its edge
of absorption will neutralize especially the energy of the gold
L-rays. This setup prevents the pile-up and allows us to move
the detector closer in order to improve the LOD down to
60 ppm for the elements Ru, Rh, Pd, Cd, Sn, and Sb. On
the resulting spectrum (Fig. 3), we can observe the energy
range where the L-lines of gold are very low in intensity,
the lack of pile-up in the region under consideration, and
the presence of trace elements Sn (1762 ppm) and Sb (123
ppm). On the same spectrum, we can also observe the peak
of xenon, which is present in the air on the path of the
incident proton beams.

This result indicates the fact that the refining of this gold
alloy is quite poor and consistent with ancient processes.
Nevertheless, an old alloy could also be used by a forger to
manufacture a modern item. Thus, we have to corroborate
these analyses with an investigation of the surface of the
alloy by SEM in order to identify eventual corrosion micro-
structures and surface treatments.

Combined methods: SEM and PIXE

Example 1

The observation of the surface of a European gold ring
presumed to date from the 5\textsuperscript{th} century AD indicates that
the decorations have been performed with a hand-tool
(Arminjon and Bilimoff, 1998). The surface of the metal
is smooth with irregular microstructures. The edges of the
engraved designs are not raised. However, we did not observe
clear weathering features, such as micro-pitting or corrosion
of grain boundaries (Fig. 4). From these results, it is difficult
to provide formal information about the chronological com-
patibility of this object with its presumed antiquity.
In such a case, PIXE analysis of the trace elements composition of the alloy is necessary. The analysis showed a very pure gold (99.6 to 99.9 wt% Au), with silver, copper, iron, nickel, calcium and chromium as trace elements (Table 1). The last four elements probably originate from the contribution of a mineral deposit. Thus, silver and copper would be the only constituting trace elements of this metal.

The ancient gold alloys contained many trace elements, such as lead, tin, platinum, palladium, zinc, bismuth, and antimony (Bugoi et al., 2003; Craddock, 2009; Demortier et al., 1999; Guerra, 2008; Guerra and Calligaro, 2003; 2004; Ontalba Salamanca et al., 1998; Ott and Schindler, 2001). The absence of a significant set of trace elements in this alloy is abnormal. This aspect suggests that the metallurgical methods employed in the making of this object do not correspond to ancient traditional ones. Its composition indicates that modern extraction and refining (thermal or electrolytic) were used (19th or 20th century AD).

**Example 2**

The analysis of a Middle East gold dagger presumed to date from the 4th-3rd century BC required a combination of the SEM and PIXE approaches to verify its authenticity. The material was a gold-silver-copper alloy. The concentration of the gold was in the range of 84 to 86%. It corresponds to 20.5 carat gold.

The three analysed areas contain iron, nickel and tin as trace elements (Table 1). The presence of tin and nickel should indicate an ancient metallurgical method. However, their concentrations are relatively low, and we did not detect any other trace elements, such as lead, antimony or platinum, for example. Yet, we also did not observe any formal evidence of modernity, such as the presence of aluminium by SEM (more than 0.1 wt%) or of cadmium by PIXE, for example (Scott, 1991; Craddock, 2009). From the PIXE results, it was difficult to draw a definite conclusion regarding the authenticity of this dagger.

The SEM micrographs of the gold indicate it has a smooth surface with irregular features and numerous pits (Fig. 5). It presents a rounded microstructure, and the profiles of depression are not sharp. We also observed an important micro-porosity. The microstructure of the surfaces appears to correspond to prolonged and natural weathering pro-

---

**Table 1**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Object</th>
<th>Point</th>
<th>Au</th>
<th>Ag</th>
<th>Cu</th>
<th>Fe</th>
<th>Cr</th>
<th>Ca</th>
<th>Ni</th>
<th>Zn</th>
<th>Ru</th>
<th>Rh</th>
<th>Cd</th>
<th>Sn</th>
<th>Sb</th>
<th>Pb</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Gold ring (presumed from 5th century AD)</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>99.9</td>
<td>1000</td>
<td>270</td>
<td>105</td>
<td>nd</td>
<td>nd</td>
<td>93</td>
<td>nd</td>
<td>nd</td>
<td>nd</td>
<td>nd</td>
<td>nd</td>
<td>nd</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td>99.9</td>
<td>716</td>
<td>193</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>nd</td>
<td>nd</td>
<td>125</td>
<td>nd</td>
<td>nd</td>
<td>nd</td>
<td>nd</td>
<td>nd</td>
<td>nd</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3</td>
<td>99.6</td>
<td>815</td>
<td>580</td>
<td>980</td>
<td>230</td>
<td>1400</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>nd</td>
<td>nd</td>
<td>nd</td>
<td>nd</td>
<td>nd</td>
<td>nd</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gold dagger (presumed from 4th-3rd centuries BC)</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>86.1</td>
<td>8.0%</td>
<td>6.0%</td>
<td>7733</td>
<td>nd</td>
<td>nd</td>
<td>152</td>
<td>nd</td>
<td>nd</td>
<td>nd</td>
<td>nd</td>
<td>nd</td>
<td>nd</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td>84.9</td>
<td>9.0%</td>
<td>6.0%</td>
<td>735</td>
<td>nd</td>
<td>nd</td>
<td>238</td>
<td>nd</td>
<td>nd</td>
<td>nd</td>
<td>nd</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>nd</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3</td>
<td>83.6</td>
<td>8.6%</td>
<td>6.0%</td>
<td>16000</td>
<td>nd</td>
<td>nd</td>
<td>216</td>
<td>nd</td>
<td>nd</td>
<td>nd</td>
<td>230</td>
<td>nd</td>
<td>nd</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gold belt (presumed from 6th - 3rd centuries BC)</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>97.8</td>
<td>0.99%</td>
<td>6780</td>
<td>nd</td>
<td>6780</td>
<td>nd</td>
<td>nd</td>
<td>nd</td>
<td>nd</td>
<td>nd</td>
<td>nd</td>
<td>nd</td>
<td>nd</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td>98.1</td>
<td>1.1%</td>
<td>4610</td>
<td>1310</td>
<td>nd</td>
<td>1450</td>
<td>nd</td>
<td>105</td>
<td>nd</td>
<td>nd</td>
<td>nd</td>
<td>2700</td>
<td>134</td>
<td>nd</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3</td>
<td>97.8</td>
<td>0.96%</td>
<td>6630</td>
<td>1440</td>
<td>nd</td>
<td>6630</td>
<td>85</td>
<td>nd</td>
<td>nd</td>
<td>nd</td>
<td>1430</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>nd</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>4</td>
<td>96.0</td>
<td>3.2%</td>
<td>7730</td>
<td>520</td>
<td>nd</td>
<td>130</td>
<td>nd</td>
<td>nd</td>
<td>nd</td>
<td>nd</td>
<td>485</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>nd</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Figure 4: SEM SE image of a gold ring. The surface and the edges of the engraved designs are smooth and not raised.

Figure 4 : Image MEB d’un anneau d’or. La surface et les bords des dessins gravés sont lisses et non saillants.
cesses affecting gold alloys (Otalba Salamanca et al., 1998; Ott and Schindler, 2001; Gusmano et al., 2004; Craddock, 2009). Thus, the results obtained from the combined methodological approach are in good agreement with the presumed period of the object.

**Example 3**

The SEM examination of an East Central Asian gold belt presumed to date from the 6th-3rd centuries BC indicates that superficial deposits are composed of a mix of silicated mineral phases, such as clay, and calcium carbonate. They also contain numerous microparticles of silver salts, which should result from the natural weathering of the gold alloy. The object has a smooth surface with irregular features, a rounded microstructure and a superficial micro-porosity. We also did not detect any modern tool marks or indications of a chemical treatment. The solders are composed of a gold-silver-copper alloy, which is consistent with ancient techniques, and we did not detect the presence of any modern element, such as zinc or cadmium. We detected iron and calcium as trace elements, but they most likely correspond to the contribution of superficial deposits.

Furthermore, the alloy also contains significant concentrations of tin, antimony and nickel as trace elements (Table 1). Their presence is in good agreement with ancient extraction techniques that were not able to remove these elements. Thus, once again, the combined study of both the surface microstructure and the composition of the alloy and the solders indicate that the object corresponds to ancient and traditional goldwork practices.

### 4. Discussion and Conclusion

This paper emphasizes that the authentication of gold objects requires the use of complementary approaches. A combination of SEM and PIXE analyses is very powerful for this purpose. The use of a single method only provides partial information regarding the antiquity of the object.

SEM investigates the surface of the object, and is able to identify fashioning and polishing tool marks, weathering features, traces of acid attacks, and the composition of the burial deposits. These investigations are limited to a surface study. Thus, in most cases, the observations of the microstructure of the gold are insufficient for obtaining formal evidence about the authenticity of an object, except for the cases of obvious fakes.

PIXE determines the composition of the alloy and characterises the concentration of trace elements, providing information about gold working techniques. This method is non-intrusive and offers powerful results, which allow estimating the chronological compatibility of the objects with their presumed antiquity. However, using this method exclusively does not allow us to discriminate forgeries made with ancient gold shreds.

As a matter of fact, the forgers take advantage of the new scientific knowledge available. If we want to be ahead of them, we have to combine several methods in order to investigate different characteristics of the objects and to improve our results in different ways. Thus, X-ray radiography or CT scanning can contribute complementary information about the homogeneity of the objects and the manufacturing techniques used. When sampling is possible, other types of analytical methods, such as ICP-MS (Guerra and Calligaro, 2004) can be useful to improve the limits of detection of lead and platinum, for example, and to neutralize the effect of specific treatments, such as superficial enrichment of gold by burnishing or *la mise en couleur de l’or* (Grimwade, 1999; Jacobson, 2000; Bachmann et al., 1999).
References


